League of Historical and Accessible Cities
PROJECT EVALUATION DRAFT Updated on 27/08/2013

1) BASELINE

Most towns in Europe have a great richness of historical and cultural heritage within their city centre. These interesting parts of the city are usually not accessible for people with disabilities , elderly people, pregnant women, families with children. Considering the 80 million of people in Europe with disability and the fact that the population is getting older, sustainable tourism has to meet new needs and face new challenges.

2) OBJECTIVES

• To improve historical towns' accessibility and sustainable tourism by providing infrastructures, services and information tools
• To create a Network of Foundations working together with cities and NGO's to lead by example, developing innovative pilot projects that can serve as an inspiration to educate and invite others to act providing, at the same time, tools to foundations, local authorities and other stakeholders
• To serve as a hub for the exchange of best practices and know-how
• To develop/implement a fully accessible itinerary (1km at least) within the city centre
• To allow tourists with disabilities, including sensory, physical and mental impairments, their friends and families to have a perfect leisure day and an intense cultural experience

3) INPUTS

3.1) Time

2010- Summer 2014 (expected ending date)

3.2) People involved directly in the project

	EFC	Via Libre	A	L	M	V	S	T	TOTAL
Full/part-time foundation staff	2	-	4	1	3	4	8	1	21
Volunteers	-	-	-	7	-	-	4	-	11
Experts	-	3	4	11	4	3	13	8	46
Architects	-	-	2	3	2	1	3	2	13
Engineers	-	-	-	3	1	-	1	-	5
Urban planners	-	-	-	1	-	1	1	1	4
Culture&heritage experts	-	-	1	1	-	-	3	1	6
Accessibility experts	-	-	1	-	-	-	1	2	4
Communication, IT experts	-	-	-	3	1	-	3	1	8
Other Consultants[1]	-	-	-	-	-	1	1	1	3
Researchers	-	-	-	3	-	1	-	-	4
NGOs & voluntary associations (paid staff)	-	1	-	3	2	4	1	2	13
Disabled people's associations	-	-	-	10	-	5	1	2	18
Local offices and authorities	-	-	-	12	28	1	1	1	43
TOTAL OF PERSONS INVOLVED									**199**

[1] A consultant is a professional who provides professional or expert advice in a particular area or specialized fields

3.3) Knowledge base for the program

Research, preliminary analysis on the accessibility situation of the different cities carried by teams of experts and advisory consultancies.
Feasibility studies, data collection, mapping and monitoring the accessibility level of streets, structures, buildings, public transports, cultural spots, shops, hotels, bars, restaurants within a given itinerary of the 5 cities.

3.4) Partnership and Networking

	A	L	M	V	S	T	TOTAL
PARTNERS							
Foundations	1	1	3	4	1	1	11
National Bodies	2	-	-	-	-	-	2
National Ministries of Culture and Heritage	1	-	1	-	-	-	2
Government departments responsible for environment and historical buildings protection	1	1	-	-	-	-	2
Research Centres	-	1	-	1	-	-	2
University Departments	-	1	-	-	-	1	2
Local Councils and Municipalities	1	2	-	1	2	1	7
Advisory consultancies	1	-	-	2	-	1	4
Public/private local cultural institutions	5	-	-	1	-	1	7
Associations of Foundations	-	1	-	-	-	2	3
PROVISIONAL TOTAL OF PARTNERS							**42**
NGOs and Associations							
Architect research associations	-	-	1	1	-	-	2
Disabled Tourists associations	-	-	-	1	-	1	2
Tourist and tourism associations	1	1	-	2	-	1	5
Associations related to disability issues	17	10	-	5	1	2	35
Voluntary associations	1	-	-	-	-	1	2
PROVISIONAL TOTAL OF NGOS AND ASSOCIATIONS							**46**
PROVISIONAL TOTAL OF PARTNERS AND ORGANIZATIONS INVOLVED							**88**

3.5) FINANCIAL RESOURCES Total project expenditure

Avila	accessible wall project	790,000 €
	Indeterminate private funding	1,100,000 €
Lucca	(not the final amount yet)	992,000 €
Mulhouse	(not the final amount yet)	1,300,000 €
Sozopol		220,534 €
Viborg		2,830,000 €
Torino		50,000 €
	PROVISIONAL TOTAL EXPENDITURE	**7,282,534 €**

4) PROCESSES

• Establishing partnerships and benefit from the political support of local authorities, disability associations, government departments responsible for environment and historical buildings protection in order to set up interventions.
• Analysing accessibility's different needs in the frame of the current situation
• Creating accessibility local strategic plans and conciliate them with existing national laws and regulations on accessibility in order to influence future projects and provide best practices.

4.1) Operations

a) TO FOSTER SUSTAINABLE TOURISM AND THE SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT OF THE CITY

• To create accessible thematic itineraries in the historical city centre in view of proposing an articulated offer to visitors and promote the city as an inclusive tourist destination
• Implementing guided tours of the city
• To make the whole historical centre largely accessible in the coming years
• To organize trainings addressed to museums, restaurants, and hotel operators on disability and public communication issues
• To improve the reception capacity and the quality of services for disabled tourists, visitors and all citizens in general
• To set up or improve help desks and tourist information points
• To connect commercial activities with the historical and cultural attractions, fostering business development through improved access to cultural heritage
• To improve the dissemination of the accessible tourism offer
• To set up an accessible tourism management system to continue the implementation of accessibility measures

b) TO IMPROVE ACCESSIBILITY FOR ALL TO BUILDINGS AND PUBLIC SPACES IN ORDER TO FOSTER INDEPENDENT VISITING AND ORIENTATION

• To remove physical barriers in order to improve buildings and public spaces accessibility through the installation of urban aids and the provision of accessible services/facilities
• To improve transportation and related infrastructures
• To improve railway and bus stations' accessibility
• To provide accessible public trains, buses and taxi services
• To realise reserved parking spaces
• To offer wheelchair rental services
• To make the city's levels of accessibility compliant with the European quality sta-rds
• To install traffic lights with electronic devices
• To improve/realise accessible pedestrian crossings

c) TO IMPROVE ACCESSIBILITY TO INFORMATION FOR ALL

• To put forward innovative communication tools in partnership with research centres and University departments
• To design and develop new innovative, accessible and ecological devices for urban mobility
• To develop accessible websites and accessible technological devices providing practical and tourist information to visit the city
• To organise training courses on web accessibility to make local associations and public institutions websites accessible for all
• To provide hand guides and maps with general touristic information and detailed information on the level of accessibility of streets, hotels, restaurants and public buildings

d) TO FOSTER A CULTURE OF ACCESSIBILITY IN EUROPE DEVELOPING A COLLECTIVE METHODOLOGY TO BE USED ELSEWHERE

• To create guides addressed to professional service providers (about public streets and spaces accessibility) and to tourist service providers (recomme-tions on how to make hotels, restaurants, historic buildings and cultural areas accessible to all)
• To give municipalities best practices back in order to define sta-rds for future interventions in the historical centre respecting historical and cultural heritage
• To create new tools together with Eurocities

4.2) Social interactions

• Interactions between all social actors: public bodies, private entities, disabled and elderly people's organisations, cultural associations and foundations working together
• Contribution and active participation of local museums in all the planning and implementation process
• Involvement of new technologies research centres and University Departments

4.3) Management of relationships

MANAGEMENT OF PUBLIC AND PRIVATE PARTNERS' INITIATIVES TOWARDS A BARRIER-FREE URBAN ENVIRONMENT

Avila	ONCE Foundation gave advisory support to Avila's City Council: accessibility experts and public work technicians designed an accessibility plan for the city of Avila to improve all the tourism areas (routes, transports, buildings, etc...). Avila's City Council has a permanent department specifically dedicated to accessibility in the city and tourism areas; ACS Foundation provides an annual grant to improve accessibility in religious buildings
Lucca	A local network involving 10 of the most representative local associations of persons with disabilities, Municipality and Foundation's technical advisers, the local Government department responsible for environment and historical buildings protection, problem solving experts. Collaboration with CESVOT (training course on web accessibility) has set up a working team involving the National Research Centre, the University of Pisa, a local firm and the association of visually impaired people
Mulhouse	Has set up a multidisciplinary working group: a support group based in Paris (which provides resources, advices, information) and an operational group based in Mulhouse (in charge of the project implementation and technical evaluation)
Sozopol	Since 2003 Sozopol Foundation has developed a number of projects together with the Municipality of Sozopol and other partners at regional, national and international level for the protection of natural and cultural heritage, as well as for the provision of access to it for everyone.

Turin	Fondazione CRT, in agreement with organizations representative of persons with disabilities, tourism promotion bodies acts as a network manager for coordination of various industry bodies, institutions and stakeholders by providing the means for creating new solutions to make Turin more accessible for all, improving access to public and private buildings of historical interest, supporting the growth of the flow of tourists with special needs through the expansion and improvement of tourist offers.
Viborg	An advisory board of people representing key-associations of persons with disabilities is assisting the foundations and the Municipality of Viborg and will be assisting the specialist group in developing the project. The project is also followed by a local advisory board representing local stakeholders and interest groups (i.e. Trade and tourist associations).

4.4) Feelings

• The project is facing a big challenge in conciliating the approach and the interests of the operators working in the cultural sector (focused on heritage protection) with the right to accessibility for all
• Difficulty in obtaining permissions to make interventions
• Necessity of finding compromises between respecting the cultural and architectural heritage and creating a modern, accessible city for all
• Face the challenge of creating a public-private partnership and make public bodies change their approach towards accessibility
• Need to increase accessibility awareness in terms of social and economic benefits
Highlight the importance of establish common sta-rds on accessibility

4.5) Sustainable tourism and the social development of the city have been promoted by:

a) REALISATION OF TOURIST ITINERARIES ACCESSIBLE FOR ALL IN THE HISTORIC CENTRE INCLUDING THE MAJOR TOURISTIC ATTRACTIONS OF THE CITY	A	L	M	T	S	V	TOTAL
PROVISIONAL ACCESSIBLE ITINERARY LENGTH IN KM	3.6	2.1	3.8	1.5	1.6	-	**12.6**

b) THE ITINERARIES INCLUDE:	A	L	M	S	T	V	TOTAL
b.1) Tourist offices and services							
Tourist offices and reception centres	2	3	1	1	1	-	8
Bars	-	19	12	-	5	-	36
Restaurants	5	15	25	-	3	-	48
Hotels	6	10	3	1	-	-	20
Shops	5	53	50	20	5	-	133
PROVISIONAL TOTAL TOURIST OFFICES AND SERVICES							245
b.2) Historical heritage buildings							
Historical buildings	11	10	21	-	2	13	57
Churches, temples, synagogues	6	10	2	1	1	2	22
Monuments	-	4	5	-	3	3	15
Museums	3	6	3	1	4	1	18
PROVISIONAL TOTAL HISTORICAL HERITAGE BUILDINGS							112
b.3) Urban public spaces							
Parks and gardens	2	3	3	1	1	5	15
Squares/streets	7	17	12	20	1	10	67
Public markets and fairs	2	-	-	1	-	1	4
Public car parks	2	-	-	1	1	2	6
PROVISIONAL TOTAL URBAN PUBLIC SPACES							92
b.4) Public buildings and offices							
Libraries	4	6	1	-	-	-	11
Schools	1	9	2	-	-	-	12
Theatres	-	2	1	-	-	-	3
Banks	3	7	10	2	1	-	23
Post offices and other offices	-	16	-	1	-	-	17
PROVISIONAL TOTAL PUBLIC BUILDINGS AND OFFICES							66
PROVISIONAL TOTAL OF ACCESSIBLE BUILDINGS, PUBLIC SPACES AND SERVICES WITHIN THE ROUTES							515

4.6) The accessibility of private, public buildings and spaces has been improved through:

a) REMOVAL OF PHYSICAL BARRIERS AND INSTALLATION OF TECHNICAL AIDS BOTH IN PUBLIC SPACES AND IN PRIVATE HISTORICAL BUILDINGS IN THE CITY CENTRE, STREET SIGNALIZATION IMPROVEMENT:	A	L	M	S	T	V	TOTAL
Traffic lights	2	3	155	-	-	-	160
Ramps	-	4	-	12	-	-	16
Pedestrian crossings	-	7	-	2	-	-	9
Accessible toilets	2	1	1	1	-	-	5
PROVISIONAL TOTAL PYSICAL BARRIERS REMOVED							190

b) IMPROVEMENT OF THE TRANSPORTATION NETWORK, SERVICES AND FACILITIES OFFERED	A	L	M	S	T	V	TOTAL
Bus stations	1	-	1	1	5	-	8
Railway stations	1	1	1	-	-	-	3
Accessible taxi services	2	-	-	-	-	-	2
Wheelchair rental services	1	-	-	-	-	-	1
Reserved parking spaces	13	6	-	3	-	-	22
Touristic trains	1	-	-	1	-	-	2
PROVISIONAL TOTAL OF INTERVENTIONS IN TRASPORTATION AND RELATED SERVICES							38
PROVISIONAL TOTAL OF TECHNICAL AIDS, SERVICES AND FACILITIES IMPROVING ACCESSIBILITY							228

4.7) The access to information has been improved throught:

	EFC	A	L	M	S	T	V	TOTAL
a) DEVELOPMENT OF ACCESSIBLE INFORMATION WEBSITES	1	1	1	1	-	-	1	5
PROVISIONAL TOTAL OF ACCESSIBLE WEBSITES DEVELOPPED								5
b) DEVELOPMENT OF INNOVATIVE TECHNOLOGICAL DEVICES								
Cyber-passes	-	1	-	-	-	-	-	1
Audio guides	-	1	-	-	-	-	-	1
Smart cane	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	1
Information devices (Totem)	-	-	1	-	-	30	-	31
GPS navigation systems with receiver and earpiece	-	-	1	-	-	1	-	2
Smart transport systems - NFC technologies	-	-	-	1	-	-	-	1
Tactile screen maps and orientation maps	-	3	3	-	-	1	-	7
PROVISIONAL TOTAL OF INNOVATIVE TECHNOLOGICAL DEVICES DEVELOPPED								44
c) TRAINING COURSES ORGANIZED	-	1	2	-	-	2		5
PROVISIONAL TOTAL OF TRAINING COURSES ORGANIZED								5
d) CONGRESSES TO SHARE EXPERIENCES	1	2	1	-	-	1	-	5
PROVISIONAL TOTAL OF CONGRESSES ORGANIZED								5
PROVISIONAL TOTAL OF TECHNOLOGICAL DEVICES AND SERVICES IMPROVING THE ACCESS TO INFORMATION								54

4.8) Implementation of a collective methodology about accessibility in europe to be used elsewhere:

	Via Libre	A	L	M	S	T	V	TOTAL
a) LHAC TECHNICAL GUIDE	1	-	-	-	-	-	-	1
b) ON-LINE ACCESSIBLE RESOURCES GUIDE	-	1	-	-	-	-	-	1
c) DVD DOCUMENTING THE PROJECT DEVELOPMENT	-	-	1	-	-	-	1	2
d) DEVELOPING OF A COLLECTIVE METHODOLOGY BASED ON SPECIFIC DIAGNOSTIC TOOLS	-	-	-	1	-	1	-	2
PROVISIONAL TOTAL OF TOOLS IMPLEMENTED TO FOSTER ACCESSIBILITY IN EUROPE								6

5) OUTCOMES

5.1) Short Term

Avila	• Proven increased number of tourists with disabilities (both as individuals and groups) • The city is chosen as the venue for meetings of associations, organizations, etc.
Lucca	• Life-quality improvement for all, citizens and tourists • Raise awareness about the importance of sharing information, setting up working groups, networks involving private and public bodies • Creation of the first accessible itinerary in the historical centre • Realization of websites containing information about reaching and visiting the accessible city of Lucca
Mulhouse	• Improved tourist global offer thanks to cultural mediation development • Improved collaboration through best practices and knowledge exchange • Identification of original and innovative actions • Setting a benchmark process for the city • Broaden approach to accessibility
Sozopol	• The fundaments of establishing an accessible environment for all have been laid by creating a network of partners, development and implementation of projects for provision of accessibility • Accessibility solutions that allow people with disabilities to fully enjoy the cultural and natural heritage have been presented
Turin	Expand and consolidate the awareness of Turin as the goal of "tourism for all" whether in the confrontation with the majority of the public or with people with disabilities • Support the increase of flow of tourists with specific needs through the expansion and improvement of the offers • Improve the positioning of Turin as an accessible destination in the confrontation of the qualified Tour Operator

5.2) Medium Term

Avila	• Promotion of the city in congresses and seminars about accessibility • Increase of investments made by public and private sectors to improve accessibility in tourism related areas
Lucca	• Proven increased number of tourists • Adoption of shared solutions to be used in all future interventions • Awareness raising on f the importance of meeting accessibility requirement in the living environment
Mulhouse	• Keep developing the accessibility of services and public buildings within a widen itinerary
Sozopol	• Further implementation of an accessible environment for all • Promotion of the development of cultural and pilgrimage tourism in the city for contribution to its social development
Turin	• Create a methodology to make all the itineraries accessible • Completely overcome the barriers architectonic, historical, social Turin with the use of modern and alternative solutions

5.3) Long Term

Avila	• Establishing Avila as a model city in accessibility • Continue focusing on accessibility management to develop long time accessibility projects
Lucca	• Continue accessibility interventions other areas of the historical centre including interventions in other services as well (public transports, schools, etc.)
Mulhouse	• Edit itinerary according to new places • Rely on new technologies (NTIC) to foster accessibility
Sozopol	• Establishing Sozopol as a city completely accessible for all • Establishing Sozopol as a global easily accessible tourist destination

6) IMPACT	
Avila	• Avila joined the LHAC project when many accessibility implementations were already been done. It was easier to continue working on that line; some of the efforts were concentrated in management procedures to implement accessibility in a long term period • Increasing cooperation with other stakeholders. Coordination with other civic authorities (Municipal Council of people with disabilities) to facilitate taking into account the point of view of people with disabilities directly involved • Accessibility is becoming a mainstreaming issue concerning and involving different municipal areas and sectors. • Raising awareness about disability at national and international level
Lucca	• Starting without having anything maybe it's easier in our case • It's not possible to say that there'll be a negative impact of the project; maybe we can say that the adopted solutions will be judged as not perfect but we can assure that the impact will be positive for the citizens, the tourists and for the Municipality • This project for the foundation is the beginning of a working progress to be annually improved, on the basis of available resources and the necessary agreements with private and public stakeholders interested in improving accessibility. We are sure that we'll go on with concrete interventions in order to cover more streets or area until at least all the historical centre will be accessible
Mulhouse	• Better and fairer sharing of information • Raising awareness about disability • Creation of networks • Enthusiasm among the stakeholders • The project bring the capacity/ability to form an association • Sharing knowledge through trainings
Sozopol	• The municipal administration, local residents and business representatives were involved in the cause of ensuring access for all
Turin	• raising awareness of the city's residents on disability • improve the touristic offer • create a dynamic team and able to propose ideas and solutions to keep up with the times share the best solutions for tourists with special needs among operators, retailers, restaurateurs, etc. ...

7) ASSUMPTIONS

• Setting up multidisciplinary working groups permits to easily mobilize and provide different skills, expertise and know-how which allow the group to cover a broad range of aspects regarding accessibility
• Different starting points in terms of accessibility, knowledge, resources and capabilities that have resulted in different types of interventions, flexible approaches and different methodologies

8) EXTERNAL FACTORS

• Signature of the UN Convention legally binding and the forthcoming European Accessibility Act
• Existing national plans and laws on accessibility
• Existing strategic urban plans for sustainable mobility and accessibility in Turin, Viborg, Avila
• Turin 2006 Winter Olympics and Paralympics Games provides significant improvements. The City has its own Accessibility Resource Centres (InformadisAbile and TurismAbile to enhance the main tourist and cultural locations' accessibility
• Accessibility is at the core of the Mulhouse Grand Centre regeneration project – whose aim is to reinforce the attractiveness of the city-centre area by embellishing housings, shops, public spaces and parking spots in order to make the city more accessible and legible for everyone. The Council decided to hold a commission dedicated to accessibility formed by Mulhouse city hall officers, associations of users, and organisations representing people with disabilities (June 2011)
• Destination Pour Tous (Mulhouse) – label used to encourage local authorities promoting accessibility for people with disabilities: accessibility to touristic attractions, to daily life services, to transport networks
• Involvement of Foundations grants in local projects in the field of disability, elderly people and children
• Avila Access City award 2011. The first European city awarded with this recognition by the European Commission